



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: April 24, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: David Morton, Acting-Chair Mark Armstrong, Member
Rodney Barker, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Bill Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member Katy Hax Holmes, Staff
See Attendance List

ABSENT: Ellen Klapper, Alternate
Len Sherman, Member

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting-Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Armstrong, Barker, Roesner, Grissom and Fulkerson. Alternate member Fitzmaurice voted. Barker left the meeting after the vote on 143 Neshobe Road. Nancy Grissom left the meeting after the vote on 15 Palmer Road. Katy Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

1521 Beacon Street – Working Session
Request to discuss options for church

Though slated to appear at this month's hearing, the attorney for the owner, Steve Buchbinder, requested to be removed from the April agenda to provide his client more time to prepare.

229 Cabot Street – Preferably Preserved Determination
Request for demolition review

Alex Valcarce, Public Buildings Department, presented the City's proposed project to conduct a feasibility study of the Cabot Elementary School building. Mr. Valcarce explained that appearing before the NHC was the beginning of a long review process and that the City had not yet determined whether a full or partial demolition of the building would be required. He emphasized that all options were on the table. Ouida Young, of the Law Department, explained that the MSBA established many of the parameters around

which the school project would be designed, and that as part of the MSBA approval process, reuse and expansion of the existing building was required for study.

Staff reported that Cabot Elementary School was built in 1928-29 in the Tudor Revival Style and was named for John Cabot, a Newtonville area resident who owned this land as early as 1854. Surveyed as NWT.3634, and designed and built by Charles R. Greco and W.B. Hollings, the school was one of 14 new school buildings erected during a time of rapid increases of school aged children in Newton, and to accommodate the burgeoning school enrollment pressure on the neighboring Underwood and Claflin Schools. Four classrooms and a gym were added in 1956. The school was renovated in 1974, and the windows were replaced in 1985. The school has steeply pitched brick gabled peaks topped by a cupola and is trimmed with cast stone decorative medallions. Cast stone trim is also found around the front entrance, window sills and two band courses. Window replacements smaller than the original window openings have resulted in painted infill panels. Staff recommended that this school building be found preferably preserved for its largely intact Tudor Revival Style architecture, and its neighborhood context for its role as the historic and visual architectural anchor for the Cabot Street neighborhood.

Grissom made a motion to find the school preferably preserved for architectural significance and historic neighborhood context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the Cabot School at 229 Cabot Street **preferably preserved** in accordance with staff's report on the historic significance of the school building, and for architectural significance and historic neighborhood context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

31 Willow Street – Preferably Preserved Determination

Request for demolition review

Josh Morse, Building Department Commissioner, presented the City's plan to conduct a feasibility study on the current and future needs of the Fire Department with regard to Station #3 in Newton Center. Mr. Morse explained that improvements to the Fire Department's response time were of paramount consideration, and that the OPM to be hired in the next few weeks would be largely responsible for conducting this study. He also explained that the study to be conducted on this station would mirror the processes underway for the school building projects in the city. Mr. Morse also discussed new seismic stability laws in the building code and how they might be adapted to historic buildings vs. new construction. Commission members asked about the layout of the current building and whether it was conducive to adaptations. Mr. Morse explained that the current configuration did not take into account the needs of female firefighters, updated rapid response equipment, larger ladder and fire trucks, or the need for wider turn radii.

Staff reported that Fire Station #3 was built in 1955 in Newton Center, was surveyed for the MHC and is catalogued as NWT.5821. The architectural style of this building has been alternatively called Utilitarian or No Style, but is more likely a simpler form of the International Style. The building was constructed by Carol Construction Company and is of brick and concrete slab. The building's emphasis is on horizontal lines and minimal architectural detailing, with metal windows, a mix of wood and metal doors, and original arte moderne metal lettering. The building is centered on three engine bays. This building replaced an earlier fire house on this site that was built in 1873 and demolished in 1954. The station cost \$272,900 to build, and with Stations #4 and #7, was completed in 1955. Given that this station is only one of three in the City to have been built in this style in 1955, staff recommends that Station #3 be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Ron Morey of Newton Highlands asked whether the NHC review procedure applied to public buildings in the same way it applied to historic homes. Ann Hochberg of Sumner Street asked if there was a chance the fire station would not be rebuilt on that site, and whether the aqueduct played into potential new siting of the station.

Grissom made a motion to find Fire Station #3 preferably preserved in accordance with staff's report on the historic significance of the building and for architectural significance. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find Fire Station #3 **preferably preserved** in accordance with staff's report on the historic significance of the building and for architectural significance.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

1164 Centre Street – Preferably Preferred Determination

Request for demolition review

Josh Morse, Building Department Commissioner, presented the City's plan to conduct a feasibility study on the Fire Headquarters building and said that a designer for the project would be hired in the next couple of weeks. He also acknowledged that the building was recognized in the past for having historical significance and said that he thought it should be found preferably preserved. Mr. Morse told the Commission that the building needed repointing, had ivy on it that needed removal, the roof needed to be replaced, the chimney needed work, but that the foundation appeared to be sound. As the emergency center building for the city, Mr. Morse explained that the emergency equipment, seismic conformity codes, and power and accessibility requirements for new emergency systems necessitated updated facilities. Commission members asked about renovating the building. Mr. Morse responded that all options were on the table.

Staff reported that this building was recognized by the City of Newton as a Category 1 historically significant building, and was found to meet the criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places as a fine example of twentieth century Classical Revival Style architecture. The building was designed by

Kendall, Taylor & Company and was constructed in 1928 as the fire headquarters of the City. Kendall, Taylor and Co. also designed buildings at 808 Beacon Street (the Newton Trust building, 1920) and the Memorial Flag Pole on the green (1922). The building still serves in this capacity. The Fire Department is conducting a feasibility study which includes options to preserve all or part of the building. Known historically as the Fire Alarm Headquarters, the building stands two stories in height and has a rectangular plan with a brick parapet and cast stone cornice and brick quoining. As with the new school buildings built in the 1920s in Newton, the explosion in population resulted in the need for state of the art fire response facilities. As an intact and well preserved example of Classical Revival architecture, staff recommends the building be found preferably preserved for its architectural integrity.

Alderman Blazar and Alderman Danberg stated that were serving on the working group for updating Fire Department facilities in Newton Center and looked forward to participating in the feasibility studies on both buildings. Carol Summers, 11 Marshall Street, told the Commission she thought the process was backwards and that she did not have confidence in the City's efforts to preserve historic buildings. Alderman Danberg told the assembled that the City worked to preserve a number of buildings, and she felt that the Headquarters building was particularly worth saving. She said the Ward 6 aldermen have no will to take down the Headquarters building.

Grissom moved to find the Headquarters building preferably preserved for its architectural integrity. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the Headquarters building at 1164 Centre Street **preferably preserved** for historic and architectural significance of the building.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

39 Barbara Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

No owner was present. Staff reported that this house was built in 1951, and the original building permit is on file with the City. Antonio S. De Angelo was the owner/architect of the house. Bertram Silver, manager of Cott's Bottling Company, owned the house in 1955. Henry Rosenblum, a company treasurer, owned the house in 1968 until at least 1975. Mary McGillicuddy moved in in 1985 and is still listed as owner. The historical context for this house is largely intact. With the exception of one house at the corner, Barbara Road consists of the same massing and style of house on very small lots for the entire length of the street. As such, staff recommended this house be found preferably preserved for historical neighborhood context.

Some Commission members questioned whether this house was worth being found preferably preserved, and because other housing was modified in the area, was that relevant in finding this house to be

preferably preserved. Others found the neighborhood to retain its massing, scale, and small lots and thought the house should be preserved for neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the building at 39 Barbara Road **preferably preserved** for historical context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member	Jean Fulkerson, Member	
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Nancy Grissom, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

18 Valley Spring Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The new owner, Vadim Kagan, told the Commission he wanted to tear down the house for the purposes of building something more modern.

Staff reported that this house was built on a cul de sac with a neighborhood of similarly designed and massed houses along the northern border of the historic Durant Kenrick property. Built in 1954, this house was designed by Stanley Myers of Cambridge and built by Ben Franklin Homes. Myers was also the architect at #6 and #11, at a minimum, and the houses on the cul de sac were built by Ben Franklin Homes. The house had no tenant in 1955, but by 1961 was inhabited by Milton Winer, manager of Harry’s Shoe Shop in Malden. The Winer family has owned the house ever since and has been its only owner. Due to its intact massing, style, and architectural consistency with the remainder of the cul de sac, staff recommends that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Commission members agreed that this house was designed and built as a concept neighborhood and believed that it should be preserved as such. Neighbors, including Andrew Gordon in the development spoke to the fact that there had been some new construction in the neighborhood but it was done in consultation with the neighbors and resulted in complementary designs. The neighbors in attendance encouraged the new owner/developer of this property to do the same. Isabel Albeck of 240 Windsor Road also stated her preference for seeing the neighborhood context preserved.

Grissom made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context and its planned concept. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 18 Valley Spring Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context and planned concept.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Rodney Barker, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

38 Wendell Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner Arthur Arbetter reported that he wished to tear down the house. In speaking to the neighbors, all were in support, he said, including the owners of 32 and 44 Wendell Road. Commission members who visited the street said they believed the neighborhood retained its historic context with a few exceptions and that the house should be preferably preserved for context.

Staff reported that this split-level ranch, built in 1956 in a neighborhood of similar construction, was owned by one family since its construction. The building permit file for this house contains one permit, and it's the one for the home's construction. The house was built by Charles D. Train, Inc. Though this neighborhood has undergone some redevelopment, houses in the immediate vicinity are intact examples of the split-level style. As such staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Some Commission members questioned whether this house was worth being found preferably preserved. Others found the neighborhood to retain its massing, scale, and lot size and thought the house should be preserved for neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the building at 38 Wendell Road **preferably preserved** for historical context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member	Jean Fulkerson, Member	
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Nancy Grissom, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

5 Wiswall Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner George Halper reported that he wished to tear down the house. He told the Commission that he had preserved the house his whole adult life so that his mother could die there as she wished, and now thought it was time to sell it. Jim Michael, architect for the owner, discussed structural concerns with the house. Terry Struth, the realtor representing the owner, told the Commission she thought houses

designed like this one were everywhere in Newton and that there was nothing special about it, despite the fact that Jan Reiner, architect, was the architect listed on the permit.

Staff reported that the house was constructed in 1951 for the same family who owns the house today. This Ranch Style house was built at the corner of Wiswall and Dedham Streets on a low hillside. A cursory review on the building permit file revealed that the house had an architect, Jan Reiner, who was educated in Prague and obtained his architecture degree from Harvard in the 1940s. While obtaining a master's degree in Prague, Mr. Reiner studied in Paris with Le Corbusier, now a very famous modernist architect. Mr. Reiner came to the States to escape the rise of Nazi German influence in Europe. A prolific writer and speaker on utilitarian housing for the common man, Reiner spoke in venues across the country to share his philosophy on affordable architecture and creative solutions for urban settlements. In the early 1950s Reiner published a book called "Low Cost Custom Homes," which included his architectural philosophy as well as sample house plans. Upon his death in 2010, the Nelson Poynter Memorial Library at the University of South Florida collected his papers and drawings and manages the collection. A search of architectural information on the web and in other venues found no other local evidence of houses designed by Jan Reiner. For this reason, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved for its architectural integrity.

Commission members asked why, if the house was preserved by the same family for so long, the house was deemed to be in structural disrepair. Mr. Michaels questioned how the Commission could preserve a house that was constructed of materials not intended to last. Discussion also ensued as to the architectural and utilitarian philosophies of Jan Reiner and whether they were worth preserving in this particular house. Commission members found the stone facing, board and battens siding, deep roof eaves, and angled garage entry to be notable representations of the Ranch Style.

Barker made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 5 Wiswall Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative:	Voting in the Negative	Abstained
Rodney Barker, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

143 Neshobe Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner Robert Murray reported that he wished to tear down the house. He did not believe that rehabilitating the house would be cost effective, due to the condition of the house and garage. Rebecca Miller and Isabel Albreck, who were in attendance, stated that it would be a shame to see this property go.

Staff reported that the house and garage were built in 1911, and that this Cottage-Style house was built on what was then a private rural lot at the end of this street. The house has stucco sheathing and a tile roof with

deep eaves. A detached garage stands at the rear of the lot. Designed by architect Harland O. Perkins, a prominent local architect from Wakefield, this house exhibits many of the same architectural tenets found in other houses he designed during this period, including two houses found on the Elizabeth Boit Estate in Wakefield, MA. The buildings on this estate were listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1989. The building permit for this house describes it as being of wood frame with plaster on wire lath. The original owner was J.L. Gooch. In 1917, the owner was Edward C. Street. In 1929 the owners were Mr. and Mrs. James E. Coggeshall, vice president of First National Corp. in Boston. In 1940, Arthur Snyder was the owner, a yarn merchant. The surrounding neighborhood has been completely redeveloped with large stately homes, leaving this property somewhat isolated both historically and visually. Due to its design by an architect of local renown and the fact that it's the oldest house still standing in the neighborhood, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved for its architectural integrity.

Mr. Murray said that the deterioration of the house was considerable, and that it needed more than just paint.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house and garage at 143 Neshobe Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Rodney Barker, Member		
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

15 Palmer Road – Partial Demolition Review

Request to demolish roof, side porch, attached garage

The architect, Donald Lang, reported that in his opinion there was no question that this house should be found preferably preserved, and that by adding to the roof height, the historic house could be adapted to modern needs without destroying the structure.

Staff reported that the building permit file for this property showed the house was constructed in 1940, with one attached garage and an attached porch on the other side. The owner and architect was Walter Graymont and the builder was Louis Byer. The hipped roof, two-story building is clapboard sided with quoining at the corners, with an arched pediment over the front entrance. The massing of the house and age of construction is similar to that found in the rest of the neighborhood, including #21 and #22 Palmer Road, and 400 Waban Avenue. In 1941 the house was owned by Donald Augustine, a teacher. He was still there in 1953. By 1968 the owner was Jackson Saltz, vice president of the Royal Coat Company, and was still there in 1975. By 1985, the owner was George White, vice president of Camex Company. Due to the intact neighborhood context of this house, and the fact that it has not had exterior alterations since its construction in 1940, staff recommended the house be found preferably preserved.

Commission Member Rodney Barker left the meeting at 9:40 pm before the vote on this property.

Grissom made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context and architectural integrity. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 15 Palmer Road **preferably preserved** for historic neighborhood context and architectural integrity.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

Mr. Lang presented his plans to remove the side porch, attached garage, increase the height of the roof, and extend out the back. Mr. Lang emphasized that the essential character of the house would be preserved while adapting it for modern life. The proposed height would change from 17'3" to 20'3". The proportions of the windows would also be changed slightly to accommodate the lengthened facades. The quoining on the corners would also be retained where possible and replicated where needed. He considered the main house block the 'jewel box' and wanted the new additions to better compliment it.

Discussion ensued about the scale of the front door. Mr. Lang believed it was appropriate to keep it the same size. He also did not want to add quoining to the additions as he believed that would be overkill.

An abutter at 400 Waban Avenue stated he had no objections to the plans. A Commission member asked that the garage doors be more visually delineated as double doors, and that the garage windows look less like residential windows.

Grissom made a motion to approve these plans for partial demolition as presented, and asked that any proposed changes to the current plans be 'clouded' for easier subsequent reviews. The architect was also asked to add a horizontal element beneath the entry pediment to bring it up to window height; remove the metal chimneys as shown on the plans, as they would not be installed there; and to return to the Commission with any changes, and file a Final Affidavit with the Commission before obtaining a building permit. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to approve these plans for partial demolition as presented, and asked that any proposed changes to the current plans be 'clouded' for easier subsequent reviews. The architect was also asked to add a horizontal element beneath the entry pediment to bring it up to window height; remove the metal chimneys as shown on the plans, as they would not be installed there; to return to the Commission with any changes; and file a Final Affidavit with the Commission before obtaining a building permit.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Jean Fulkerson, Member	Bill Roesner, Member	
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Nancy Grissom, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

Commission member Nancy Grissom left the meeting after the vote on 15 Palmer Road.

25 Old Farm Road – Partial Demolition Review

Request to demolish the roof

The builder for this property, Jihad Haddad, reported that he wished to add a second story addition to a one story addition that had been approved administratively in 2000.

Staff reported that this high style pre-war Modern Traditional house was constructed in 1937 in a neighborhood of other large homes from this period. Many have since undergone additions and alterations. This house had a rear screen porch added in 1996 and updates to bathrooms, but aside from those changes the house has remained architecturally intact. Directories do not show an owner in 1938, but John E. Warner, vice-president of Buxbaum Company Incorporated lived there in 1945. By 1961 the house was owned by Arthur Karol, a structural engineer. By 1975 the house was owned by Dean Doner, a professor at Boston University. The house has been little altered since its construction and fit was once a pre-war Modern aesthetic, which is in transition on this street. It was staff's recommendation that this house be found preferably preserved.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood historic context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 25 Old Farm Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

Plans were reviewed for the proposed right rear roof addition to the second story. Commission members found the plans lacking clarity, and there was no proposed view from the street of the raised rear roof. The new roof was described as being part of the existing ridge, but views on the plans were deemed insufficient to support this. Dormers on the front of the house would also be removed, which was also not clear from the plans.

No waiver was granted for this proposed roof, and the builder agreed to work with the architect to improve the plans. Materials requested from the owner were: better views of the project from the front façade; reduction in the massing of the proposed addition to keep it within the historic building envelope; a new plan that keeps the existing dormers and ridgepole intact.

105 Oldham Road – Partial Demolition Review

Request to demolish the roof and front facade

The architect representing the owners, Nancy Sadecki, presented plans to alter the roofline, windows, façade treatments, and side addition. The house is a split-level located at the end of a cul de sac with like houses, and the owners wished to update the house while retaining the basic plan of the house.

Staff reported that this split level ranch, located at the end of a cul-de-sac in Newton Center, was built in 1960 with a one car garage and owned by Edward B. Nardone. The house changed owners multiple times thereafter, with David Rubin buying the house in 1961 (VP); Ernest Lowe, a professor at BU Medical School owned the house in 1976; and in the 1980s, San-Lang Lien. In 1996 the house had a kitchen and bath renovation and addition. The low profile and horizontality of this house is a feature found in other houses at the end of this road, which has had no demolitions on the cul-de-sac. Meyer and Meyer Architects will be presenting a new design for the house which will alter the roofline and change the front of the house. Given the intact architectural nature of the north end of this cu-de-sac, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood historic context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-1:

RESOLVED to find the building at 105 Oldham Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Jean Fulkerson, Member	
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

The architect explained that the house had two additions, to the side and rear, and that the owners wished to keep them integrated into a newly designed Colonial house. The architect worked with them to come up with the current design instead. The new design as described as having been informed by the original design, with the eye being tricked into seeing the new house as having a similar level rather than split. The house would have a real stone veneer and horizontal clapboard siding. The single garage would shift to a double garage, with doors slightly offset on the site plan.

Commission members had questions about the eave overhang to the left of the second garage door opening. Some wanted it shortened to clarify the framing detail around the second door opening. Members expressed their belief that this design preserved the integrity of the original split-level design, but wished to see the small eave detail amended.

Armstrong made a motion to accept the designs as presented, with the condition that the eave detail be reduced near the second garage door opening and a Commission architect review the revision when submitted to staff. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to accept the designs as presented, with the condition that the eave detail be reduced near the second garage door opening and a Commission architect review the revision when submitted to staff. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Jean Fulkerson, Member

Bill Roesner, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

57 Metacomet Road – Waiver of Delay

Request to waive demo delay

Robert Murray, owner of this house, presented his plan to replace the current Colonial Style house with a Stick Style house. This property received a preferably preserved finding on September 26, 2013.

At the September meeting, staff stated that this 1919 Colonial Revival residence was located in a Waban neighborhood with other early 20th century buildings. The architect for this building was Harry Morton Ramsay, a Boston based architect who designed several buildings in Newton including nearby 45 Metacomet Road. The first owners were George and Edith Gosman. George worked as a doctor. The existing building has suffered some deterioration of the wood trim and windows, but retains its original features including, windows, trim, brick façade, and slate roof. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of other Colonial Revival style residences as well as Tudor style residences. The building contributes to an early 20th century architectural context. At the September meeting, Murray stated that he had originally intended to renovate and add onto the building, but after examining the deterioration caused by roof leaks as well as an oil leak, he determined that renovation would not be economically feasible. At that meeting, staff presented a letter in support of preserving the building from Varda and Neal Farber. Varda and Neal Farber also spoke expressing support for the preservation of the building. Dr. Katz at 1865 Beacon Street spoke in favor of preserving the building. Isabelle Albeck at 240 Windsor Road also spoke in favor of preserving the building. Commission members expressed support for preserving the building.

A petition with 76 signatures in support of preserving the existing house was submitted to the Commission. Nine emailed letters, eight in support of preserving the structure, were also received. Abutters present at the hearing spoke in support of saving this structure.

Murray said he wanted the new design to highlight details from the existing house. Commission members commented on the larger footprint of the proposed house, and how the larger design was inconsistent with the scale of other houses in the neighborhood. The asymmetrical proposed house plan was also contrasted with the symmetry of the existing house.

Rebecca Miller, 20 Metacomet Road in Waban, said there were six people in attendance who wanted to see the house preserved. She said the neighborhood wanted to see an addition on the house, not see it torn down.

Don Fabrizio, a partner in Murray's project, asked the neighbors in attendance if they would be willing to purchase the house from them. Murray told the assembled that he could sell the house to someone else who could wait out the delay and then build something less attractive than what he was proposing. Albreck, 240 Windsor, spoke to the increased FAR that would result from this new proposed house.

Roesner made a motion to deny the waiver due to the fact that the existing house had architectural qualities that should be preserved, and the proposed design was not relevant to the house as it currently appeared. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-1:

RESOLVED to deny the waiver at 57 Metacomet Road due to the fact that the existing house had architectural qualities that should be preserved, and the proposed design was not relevant to the house as it currently appeared.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
Dave Morton, Acting Chair	Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate	
Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		

207 Varick Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner Armando Petruccelli reported that he wished to tear down the house. He said the ceilings were too low and that the house was too small to make modern.

Staff reported that this Gambrel Style house was built in 1947 and had three symmetrical dormers and a rear shed dormer. The owner and builder at the time was William J. Downey. In 1949 the house was owned by Alice L. Thorpe, widow of Edward E. In 1955, the house was owned by another widow Mary K. Craven. By 1961 the house was owned by Frederick Ford, a marketing director in Salem, MA whose family owned the house until at least 1992. The house was sold to the current owners in 2005. This house was built in a similar massing and style to other houses on the street, which has seen little demolition/development. The architectural detailing on this house also appears to be original to its construction in 1947. For this reason staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context.

Commission members found the house to be small but that the neighborhood retained its massing, scale, and small lots and thought the house should be preserved for neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 207 Varick Road **preferably preserved** for historical context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Jean Fulkerson, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

51 Plainfield Street – Approve revised plans

Request to waive demo delay

The owner and architect appeared before the Commission after having received an approval in principal on their latest plans during last month's hearing. The architect told the Commission that he had responded to the Commission's concerns and fixed the flat arched windows, articulated the side facades, and added more verticality to the windows. He also showed the Commission that he had lowered the ridge to make it tie in better to the front corner.

In September 2013, the waiver was not approved for the following reasons: Commission members felt that additions could be added that have desirable modern amenities rather than a full demolition of the National Register-listed property. In November 2013, the waiver was not approved due to the Commission's belief that additions off the back of the building could help to save its historic integrity, and that the new design placed most of the bulk of the building at the front of the lot unlike the existing building. At the February meeting, the owner and developer presented an older set of plans by mistake and promised to return to a future meeting with revised plans. At the March meeting, the developer was asked to do more design work on the proposed replacement structure, by incorporating flat-arch windows, reducing the size of the center window, re-articulating the window sizes, and removing the vestigial roof and column before returning to the NHC for approval.

Commission members commented on the improvements that this design had undergone, but that the stairway windows were still a little odd. Isabel Albeck asked the Commission why, if this house was on the NR and had a delay lasting until November, did the Commission feel it had to approve a replacement design. The architect responded that the proposed house was well under the allowed FAR.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the design as amended, with the condition that the stair windows be changed to a 6/6/1 configuration. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to approve the design as amended, with the condition that the stair windows be changed to a 6/6/1 configuration. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Jean Fulkerson, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

180-182 Cherry Street – Approve revised plans

Request to waive demo delay

The owner and architect appeared before the Commission after having received an approval in principal on their latest plans during last month's hearing. The architect told the Commission that he had responded to the Commission's concerns and amended the window profiles, kept the existing window configuration on the new plans, and proposed a stone veneer for the new foundation.

Commission members commented on the improvements to the design.

At the February meeting, this c.1870 end-gable house was found to be preferably preserved at the February 2014 meeting due to its retention of its massing and historical context in the neighborhood. Evidence of a house at this location first appears on the 1874 insurance maps under the ownership of the J.W. Conroy family, who continue to own the house through the 1960s. By 1971, John Marino was the owner and the two-car garage was built in 1975. The garage, because of its date of construction, did not meet the criteria for the demo delay ordinance and thus was not subject to NHC review. In 2010 a building permit was granted to replace the roof and add a ridge vent. In 2013 the house was sold to CZ Development. The neighborhood is a mix of twentieth-century infill development, as well as Italianate houses with Queen Anne style updates.

No waiver was granted at the February meeting, due to the following reasons: Commission members told Tom that his plans for the property were not appropriate for the size and scale of the historic house and that the window patterns on the new addition should attempt to mirror those on the old house. In addition, the window openings on the historic house should be left intact so as to preserve its historic character. The addition should also be set back from the house and not be co-planar and in a different style from the historic house. The addition should also be lower than the roof line of the historic house, as well as try to match the roof pitch of the house gable. One Commission member said that he thought the proposed addition was so out of scale that he was at a loss as to how to articulate it. At the March meeting the plans as presented were approved in concept, but needed more information on materials and sizes of proposed windows in the main house and addition. Commission members also wanted to see the construction drawings.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the design as amended, with the addition of stone veneer to the foundation to be approved by staff. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to approve the design as amended, with the addition of stone veneer to the foundation to be approved by staff. The motion also included the directive that any changes to the plans be 'clouded' for clarity, and that a Final Affidavit be submitted before obtaining a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Jean Fulkerson, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

125 Webster Street – Partial demo review

Request to demo rear addition and garage

The owner appeared before the Commission to discuss proposed plans to remove the rear addition(s) and demolish the attached garage. No plans had been prepared yet for the National Register-listed house.

Staff reported that this house was located in a National Register Historic District and was built c.1860 in the Italianate Style. The end-gable structure with returns faces Webster Street, with an arched window in the gable that is emblematic of the Italianate Style. The front veranda on the house is a later addition and was built in the Queen Anne style, likely from the 1880s. Mrs. Charles May a widow and Lydia Dodge, a local grammar school teacher owned the house in 1874. Due to the house's location in a National Register district and the fact that it retains its historical context, massing and detail, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed due to its listing on the National Register. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed due to its listing on the National Register.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------

Jean Fulkerson, Member		
Dave Morton, Acting Chair		
Bill Roesner, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate		

Minutes from the March meeting were unanimously approved. The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 12:07 am.

Katy Hax Holmes
Staff